

and first (public) editor (Mary's mother, evidently her first editor).

5: Letters Concerning Mary Tighe (extracts).

6: Inventory (or census) of Known Copies of *Psyche* (1805).

7: Late Verses & Fugitive Verses.

The principal achievement of the edition, certainly for textual purists, is its apparatus. This is where we see the editors working critically on the long, involved history of Tighe's poetry. In addition to a thorough introductory essay, the editors supply a dedicated statement on their methodology, copy-text selections, and editorial principles (orthography, syntax, capitalization, punctuation, variants, and their own changes to original text). Though a modern edition, in modern typography, the original material itself is (thankfully) *not* modernized; contemporary spelling, syntax, punctuation, and capitalization are (mostly) preserved in the interest of retaining the original physical appearance and aural character of Tighe's writing (her voice, her sound). The edition's

Textual Notes (three groupings), where we see the editors' direct engagement with the poet's words and thought, are entirely useful, with identifications of the poems' substantive variants and Tighe's references to various persons, places, events.

The best of the edition's textual work is the section on deattribution (Appendix 1): eight verses from earlier editions and sources are set aside, with explanations, as "false" ("doubtful," "suspicious") inclusions in the Tighe canon. And may this excite response. Also of special interest is the editors' discussion of the variants and development (pre-1805) of the *Psyche* manuscript itself (Appendix 3), this being a superb illustration of the poet's creative process and critical editing of her own work. (The editorial hand of Mary's mother merits a closer glance.)

Should this edition see a second printing, the editors might consider the following suggestions and recent information: Surely a detailed General Index should be compiled in this busy book of names, locations, and subjects. Likewise, dedicated attention,

perhaps in new appendices, to surviving likenesses of Mary Tighe (see Perkins, "Tighe," *Oxford DNB*, 2004), as well as new attention to the intersections of the Tighe-Blachfords with the Dublin and London book trade, their printers and publishers. And the editors will need to update Appendix 6, as the Gerald N. Wachs Collection copy of Tighe's *Psyche* (1805), dedicated to "C.H." (Tighe's cousin, Caroline Hamilton), recently fetched \$4000 at Sotheby's. Earlier sales were pathetically lackluster (e.g., \$250, Quaritch, London, 1977), attesting to dramatic appreciation in Tighe. (For book valuations, the editors must consult the premier, online resource for book sales: Rare Book Hub, San Francisco; 13 records, to date, for Tighe.) Sotheby's also sold, in June, 2017, for £150,000, a Kashmiri sapphire-and-diamond ring, reputedly Mary Tighe's (Fine Jewels, Lot 58; sale page, with image, online). But most important, we urge the editors to fully honor their material and their readers' expectations by supplying

several full-page images of Tighe's own manuscripts, as well as images of her rare 1805 *Psyche*, an important example of early-nineteenth-century British book arts. (The Mulvihill Collection includes the Lytton Strachey copy, with Strachey book label designed by Dora Carrington.)

The Johns Hopkins *Tighe* will be a desirable addition to library reference collections and to the home libraries of scholars and some collectors. The edition is an important contribution to the history of women writers, and may the editors' commitment to scholarly editing inspire and guide future projects.

In 2018, the Royal Irish Academy, Dublin, launched *Prodigies of Learning*, an exhibition on notable Irish women. Maria Edgeworth and others were included, but not Mary Tighe. With the prominence of new work on Tighe, we hope for a forthcoming event, honoring her legacy. •

—Princeton Research Forum, N.J.

The Irish Down Under

BY JEFF KILDEA

A "NEW" HISTORY of a subject is usually one that either supersedes its predecessor, consigning it to a quiet retirement in the library stacks, or one that complements it with updated research and revised interpretations as well as supplementing it by including more recent events. Relative to Patrick O'Farrell's classic work *The Irish in Australia*, first published in 1986, *A New History of the Irish in Australia* by Elizabeth Malcolm and Dianne Hall is of the latter type rather than the former. But it is also "new" in the sense that it takes a radically fresh approach to the subject in both content and form, and therein lies its strength.

Elizabeth Malcolm and Dianne Hall.

A NEW HISTORY OF THE IRISH IN AUSTRALIA. CORK UNIVERSITY PRESS, 2019. €25.

In terms of content, more than a generation has passed since O'Farrell's book appeared and the issues and questions about the Irish in Australia raised then are of less concern to readers today, whose interests now lie in the direction of identity politics, interactions with Indigenous Australia, gender issues, popular culture, and mental health. Divided into three sections: Race, Stereotypes and Politics, *A New History* focuses on these contemporary areas of interest.

The section on race, which covers four chapters and occupies fully one-third of the book, examines the identity of the Irish in Australia and their immigration experience relative to other groups such as the British, the Aborigines and the Chinese. The treatment of the last two early on sets *A New History* apart from its predecessor. Whereas O'Farrell made passing references to interactions between the Irish and the Aborigines and Chinese, Malcolm and Hall devote a chapter to each, exploring not only the well-trodden path of conflict on the frontier or the goldfields, but also opening up new lines of inquiry regarding how they lived together, covering aspects such as intermarriage and family life.

So fresh is this subject matter that the authors admit they do not have answers to the many questions they raise, inviting other researchers to take up the issues and run with them. They make a similar plea in the section entitled "Stereotypes," which occupies another third of the book and comprises four chapters relating to the portrayal of Irish men and women in popular culture, discrimination in employment and the perceived propensity of the Irish to crime and mental illness. At the end of the chapter on crime and the Irish, in which the authors present evidence to discredit "hostile stereotypes about the violence and lawlessness of the Irish" they state that "a more substantial, longer-term national study ... is required" (231). In reference to mental health they observe, "more work is still needed before we have a reliable picture of the historical relationship between the Irish and Australian mental health services" (233).

In terms of form, while it is true that O'Farrell used chapter headings that were largely thematic, his book is essentially a broad-ranging narrative history that generally unfolds chronologically. *A New History*, by contrast, is essentially thematic in that it concentrates on a few specific topics where events are used to illustrate particular themes. An example of the difference is the respective treatment of the attempt by the self-confessed but mentally deranged Fenian, Henry James O'Farrell, to assassinate Queen Victoria's second son, Prince Alfred, in 1868 at a picnic at Clontarf Beach on Sydney Harbour. While O'Farrell describes that event in detail as part of his examination of the influence of Fenianism in mid- to late-nineteenth-century Australia, Malcolm and Hall provide a much shorter description of the affair in a chapter titled "Irish men in Australian popular culture, 1790s–1920s" (136–37).

That chapter explores how cartoonists depicted Irish men using caricatures based on well-known stereotypes, such as the simian-featured Fenian terrorist or Paddy the hilarious buffoon or the corrupt Tammany politician. Similarly, the careers of Irish-born politicians of the nineteenth century, such as John O'Shanassy, Charles Gavan Duffy, and Bryan O'Loughlen, are discussed by reference to how they were

portrayed in the hostile press: "Politicians of every persuasion were of course caricatured, but the motives of few were as seriously impugned as those of the Irish" (153). Many events and people are discussed in that manner, in some cases across different chapters to exemplify the particular theme under consideration. Such is the case with the three premiers who also appear in the third section titled "Politics." That section contains two chapters covering the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, respectively, and examines particular issues, such as how the Irish struggled to be accepted as political leaders, especially in the nineteenth century.

Thus, *A New History* is not a conventional narrative of what the Irish did in Australia; rather, it is an extended essay, or series of essays, on how they were perceived and portrayed in certain situations and how they perceived and portrayed themselves. As such it is no mere historical inquiry, for as the authors point out in the Epilogue, many of the stereotypes, jibes and jokes that were employed in the nineteenth and early twentieth century continue to have currency today:

The challenge then is to recognise what these stereotypes meant in the past and to try to understand why they remain comprehensible and potent in 21st-century Australia, more than a century after the end of large-scale Irish immigration. A nation of immigrants, like Australia was in the 19th century and is today, cannot afford to take such humour lightly: jokes, and the negative stereotypes they perpetuate, are a serious matter (349).

To meet that challenge *A New History* examines the experience of the Irish in Australia through that hermeneutic lens across a range of topics. While O'Farrell touched on many of the same topics, for the most part Malcolm and Hall devote considerably more space to each of them, so that, with about one-half the word length, they also leave out much of the story. But that is a consequence of *A New History* being more a series of essays on specific aspects of the Irish in Australia than a com-

prehensive history. Bearing that in mind, *A New History* should be judged on its own merits and not by comparison with O'Farrell's *The Irish in Australia*.

Even so, by squeezing into just 37 pages the frenetic twentieth century, with its sectarianism, its debates over Irish self-government and conscription, and its Labor Party splits, at a time when Irish influence on politics was at its peak, the authors have taken a risk. However, with their detailed knowledge of the Irish in Australia, the authors do a remarkably good job summarizing the period, albeit with a few missteps. For example, Sinn Féin was not banned in Australia after the 1918 St Patrick's Day parade as claimed (324). Rather it became an offence to engage in certain acts of "disloyalty" or to display flags or emblems of the "movement known as Sinn Féin." A criticism of the book as a whole is that it tends to concentrate on the experiences of the Catholic Irish, even though, as the authors point out, "historians have estimated that around 25 per cent of Irish immigrants to Australia were Protestants" (7). Yet, given the book's focus on perception and portrayal and on negative stereotypes, perhaps that is understandable.

The constant lament of specialist historians of the Irish in Australia, including the current authors, is that general historians have tended to denude the Irish of their distinctive but multifaceted ethnicity (11–14). They have done so by assimilating them as "British" or consigning them to the religious category "Catholic" or acknowledging them only as participants in violent events and sectarian conflict or, worst of all, ignoring them altogether. While the authors of *A New History* disparage the term "Anglo-Celtic," quite rightly when used in expressions such as "Anglo-Celtic monoculture" (343–46), it is well to remember that E.W. O'Sullivan promoted its use in the 1880s in opposition to the homogenization inherent in terms such as "Anglo-Saxon" into which the Irish were often subsumed. O'Sullivan's aim was to ensure due acknowledgment of the Celtic contribution to the British Empire, a point that critics of the term often overlook.

To those working in the field of Irish studies, it is readily apparent that to under-

stand the history of Australia post-1788 one needs to understand the history of the Irish in Australia. Yet, despite the plethora of published research revealing the crucial role the Irish played in making modern Australia across a broad range of fields, the message somehow has not got through. More than thirty years after O'Farrell's popular,

award-winning history appeared, the problem remains. As Malcolm and Hall observe,

The massive 1200-page, two-volume *Cambridge History of Australia*, published in 2013, also relegated the Irish to a very minor role. In the index to the first volume, there were just eight

entries on the Irish, compared with 42 on the Chinese; in the index to the second volume, there were no entries on the Irish at all (11-12).

Whether *A New History* with its new approach will have more success than its

predecessor in influencing general histories of Australia is yet to be seen. But for those wanting to know about the Irish in Australia from a fresh and contemporary perspective *A New History* will more than satisfy. •

—University of New South Wales

Faith, Politics, and the Irish Landscape

BY SEÁN FARRELL MORAN

BEFORE MARC BLOCH was executed by the Gestapo, he argued that historians needed to consider the “whole human environment” when trying to understand the past. When Bloch's student Fernand Braudel became perhaps the most famous of the second generation of *Annalistes* after the war, he differentiated between his famous *la longue durée* and its history of the social, economic, and political structures in which men and events make their mark, and a *l'histoire quasi immobile*, that seemingly motionless but critical history of the geography, environment, and the land. Braudel, who may be the most respected historian who is rarely actually read, did make it impossible for us to merely genuflect before geography as historians once did. Most histories tuck geography away in an introductory chapter if they address it at all. Yet one can say Irish history has been slow to seriously consider the nature of human interaction with the land of Ireland. Thus there is welcome news in the appearance of two recent books from Four Courts Press and how they describe the intimate, deep, and often troubled connections between religion, politics, and the landscape of Ireland.

Kevin Whelan.

RELIGION, LANDSCAPE

AND SETTLEMENT IN IRELAND.

FOUR COURTS PRESS, 2018. €40.50

C.J. Wood.

BODENSTOWN REVISITED: THE GRAVE OF WOLFE TONE, ITS MONUMENTS AND ITS PILGRIMAGES

FOUR COURTS PRESS, 2018. €45.00

Kevin Whelan's *Religion, Landscape and Settlement* is a remarkable and groundbreaking work of Irish history. Whelan, at once a historian, geographer, cartographer, and antiquarian, has now revealed the myriad connections between religion and the Irish landscape, and enriched this subject by incorporating a rich tapestry of literary and popular cultural references to complete his tale. The book is perhaps one of the clearer works that demonstrate that memory tells us far more than the archives ever can about the relationship of people and culture to the place where they have lived and continue to live, as it invariably attaches itself to a place. In many ways this is a history of human interaction with the land, recalled and understood within personal and shared memories which have been both experienced and passed down over time. It gives a kind of eternal life to places and buildings, to ruins, and to the presences of things that are no longer seen but are well remembered and continue to exist in some deep and non-rational way.

It is regrettable that Whelan never

seems to state a thesis in this work, but instead plunges the reader into a long chronological stream enumerating the many layers demonstrating the ongoing impact of religion upon Ireland's topography. This chronological commitment presents its own problems in terms of interpretation and analysis, seen from the very beginning as he starts this story with the coming of Christianity. Doing so puts the cart well after the horse. For how many millennia



before St. Patrick did Irish men and women practice some kind of religious culture and in the process altered the look of the land? Long before institutionalized and bureaucratic Christianity made it to Ireland, the landscape was altered by people of faith. Despite this major omission, the author nevertheless amply demonstrates just how rich was that pagan contribution to the new religion, and how it continued to effect Christians in their religious lives and that religious landscape down through the centuries.

What a profoundly religious place Christian early medieval Ireland was to become in very short order. With over 5,500 churches and religious sites by the late fifth century, Christianity had an institutional presence in Ireland maybe without equal in Europe at the time. The religious landscape had to be remarkable with the numerous buildings, compounds, holy sites, and pathways trod by the faithful. Parochial boundaries became known intuitively over time, important lines of demarcation between *tuatha* and then later between families, and around them developed shared histories that are still remembered by the faithful and secularized alike. Local life became anchored in those ancient parishes and retained its connections in spite of war, religious changes, oppression, and demographic catastrophe. The oft-noted palimpsest of Irish history is perhaps never more obvious than in this relationship between faith, community, and the soil.

Whelan demonstrates the endless richness of the interaction between the landscape and the imagination. The result was a “countryside ... animated by strongly

felt but invisible presences” (108), where magical realism was lived out long before fiction writers used it as a literary style. In medieval and early modern Ireland reason and “enlightenment” did little to erode the popular sense of the land being a physical space that was animated and alive. In the 1890s the American ethnographer Jeremiah Curtin marveled at the vibrant “intercourse between the visible and the unseen worlds, between what we call the dead and the

living—a certain intimate communion between what has been and what is.” (109). The hard-bitten Ernie O'Malley confirmed that in his childhood in Mayo, and even afterward, this sense of immediacy with the dead remained a part of everyday life. Whelan makes the surely correct observation that this was not some superstitious holdover from the ancient past but was instead a result of a seventeenth-century synthesis of vernacular beliefs and Catholic and especially Franciscan theology. Critical to this was a complex network of sites of pilgrimage such as Croagh Patrick and Lough Derg, places notable not only because of their saintly connections but their distinctive topography as well.

Protestantism's effects ranged from an increasingly accommodating Anglicanism to the sterner stuff of the Dissenter's theology which took issue with the popular expressions of Catholic devotional life. Initially, they looked toward their Scottish churches for architectural inspiration, and in the nineteenth century they embraced Greek revivalism rather than the neo-Gothicism which took over Irish Anglican and Catholic ecclesiastical architecture. But the Dissenter's architectural style did have an effect upon Catholic church building in Ulster. Whelan also notes how non-conformists like the Quakers and later various evangelical groups contributed to the landscape.

Whelan's is a work rich in detail and it opens the door for a lot of future research, but again, the lack of a clear thesis is problematic. The rich details he presents suggest something which cries out for some connective thread. The chapter on the

Catholic revival does cover some well-trodden ground and adds to the subject. His section of Catholic chapel building and the typical movement from the Mass rock and gardens which “imprinted” itself on Catholic memory (179), to the building of chapels and then churches is very fine. But he shies away from diving into the inevitable political implications presented by the newly resurgent church. The chapter on the “two cities” of Belfast and Dublin is a treasure trove of information but one wishes Whelan had developed further his sub-chapter on Catholicism and colonialism, and especially his observation that “Irish Catholicism had therefore developed its identity through two sets of filters—British and Roman—that cut it doubly off from its indigenous roots.” (222)

C. J. Woods presents us with the history of Wolfe Tone's burial site and the history of nationalist pilgrimages to it in *Bodens-town Revisited*. With this book, the author, a former member of the Royal Irish Academy, has established himself as the authority on this place and the endlessly evolving commemorative events which have surrounded it. The book is a chronologically organized compendium of Bodens-towniana which traces the site from Tone's burial near Sallins down to the present. Except for locals and his family the burial place was largely forgotten until Thomas Davis “discovered” it and immortalized it in poetry in 1843, a work of art that more than anything else raised Tone into being a political icon.

By the early 1870s the grave began to be a locus of Republican pilgrimages of remembrance and reaffirmation. Woods provides a survey of how the meaning of the place changed over time, how the memorial itself changed since the mid-nineteenth century, and details the ever-changing nature of the pilgrimages and speeches around it. If Richard Keegan's first commemorative oration at Bodens-town in 1873 was largely a survey of Tone's life and accomplishments, the orations became critical statements of Republican purpose and intentions (65ff). This has thus inevitably meant that controversy, competition, and disagreement have shadowed the gravesite commemorations, and Woods lays that out in a year by year scenario. In 1929 and 1930 there were three separate Republican pilgrimages to Bodens-town: rival pilgrims seeking benediction from the martyr. The memorial has been a contested place, and those journeys to it reflected the fluctuations in Irish politics and in particular, the various transformations and competing versions of Irish nationalist ideology and its various constituencies.

Wood's chronological schema provides a useful overview of this history, but it cataloging of all these events begs for some kind of interpretive intervention. If the author is to claim, as he does in his conclu-